

Chapter 3 Procedure

3.1 Introduction

The procedure of this study has three main aspects. First it relies on the production of a corpus of aural and oral texts of four stories found in the written version of the Chinese Bible (Chinese Union Bible). Secondly, it applies modified and adapted methods of discourse analysis to the analysis of the produced texts. Lastly it categorizes and summarizes the findings in relation to areas of contrast between the three media.

The procedure for the contrastive analysis in this study is as follows. It is divided in three major sections: 1) Text production, 2) Display, annotation and analysis of the three versions, and 3) Categorizing and summarizing findings. The first section begins with story selection. Then steps involved in the text production of the aural versions are presented. Next, the production and transcription of the oral version is documented and explained. The second section shows how the texts were displayed for the sake of comparison. It also gives details about the linguistic parameters applied to the texts. It then presents a way for a three-way comparison and analysis of the three versions. The last section provides tools to categorize and summarize the findings discovered through the application of the methodology.

3.2 Corpus production of the three versions

The first section describes the production of the text corpus used in this study. It gives special attention to the procedures involved with creating and documenting the aural and oral versions.

3.2.1 Story selection:

According to Kelber (1983:44-89) there are stories told in the Gospel of Mark which share the same or similar genre. He also states that the Gospel of Mark is marked with the most oral features in Greek (among the other gospels in the Christian Bible) and has a tradition of being not only transmitted by writing, but also by live

performance.¹⁶ The written and oral characteristics and tradition of the Gospel make it an appropriate text to be translated and used in this study. The following stories (along with reference titles) were selected from the Gospel of Mark corresponding to the categories set forth in Kelber (1983:46).

- Mark 2:1-12 Healed by friends;¹⁷
- Mark 5:1-2 Démoniac;
- Mark 5:21-43 Dead girl and sick girl; and
- Mark 9:14-30 Healing boy.

The Chinese Union Bible was chosen for this study for both linguistic and sociolinguistic reasons. Xinyi Zhao, in her Master's thesis *Translation Theory in the Chinese Context: A comparative approach* states that when the translation of what now is known as the Chinese Union Bible was finished in 1919, it became a leading force for the New Literature Movement, which advocated using 'plain' language' in literature (Zhao 2004: 30). The Chinese Bible was eventually used as one of the textbooks in Chinese schools to help teach common Chinese (Zhao 2004: 32). The role that the Chinese Union Bible has played in standardizing Chinese is important to note in the exploration of this study. The Chinese Union Bible is itself an example of how medium can shape how a language is articulated, as in its composition it contributed to creating and standardizing language.

Zhao expresses a sentiment among many Chinese Christians, stating, "More Bible translation work was carried out in the 20th Century in China. But none of the resulting translations challenge the status of the Union Mandarin Version" (2004:30). She also states that most Chinese churches do not accept any other translation other than the Chinese Union Bible (2004:32). This status of the Chinese Union Bible is important to note, because it was and remains, the 'authorized' version of the Chinese Bible, not only by the government of the People's Republic of China, but also by the majority of the Church in China. Thus, even though there are other translations of the Bible in Chinese, the Chinese Union Bible has remained the

¹⁶ Green comments on Kelber: "Werner Kelber, who examined the Gospel of Mark in light of the characteristics of oral style put forth by Ong and others, concluded that Mark was written after the stories about and teachings of Christ had been repeated orally for many years, and that the writing of Mark reflects the oral style of that tradition (Kelber 1983:21, 44-45, 90)" (Green 2007:30).

¹⁷ The English titles are supplied by the researcher for easy references.

most widely used and accepted version. It is for these reasons that the Chinese Union Bible is the written version used in this study.

3.2.2 Text production: Aural

Mrs. Wu, age 25, produced the aural version in this study. She is a native Mandarin Speaker who grew up in Southern China. She is a college graduate. She is also fluent in: Gui Liu Hua (Mandarin-based southern Chinese dialect spoken in Guangxi province), Standard Mandarin Chinese, and English; with speaking competency in: Cantonese and Thai. She has been a Christian for over 8 years and was familiar with these stories prior to this study.

The working method used to produce the aural translation was an 'aural/visual' translation method, referred to in this study as Visual-Audio Drafting (VAD). VAD is a version of oral drafting similar to that used in the OneStory Partnership and suggested by Green (2007) and Sundersingh (2001) for the production of aural translations. However, it has been modified in this study in several ways: 1) A visual, yet non-literate, component was added to the drafting process. 2) Unlike in the OneStory Method, this draft has not undergone translation consultant review or any form of secondary editing, in order to preserve the original state of this aural translation draft for the sake of analysis. 3) The aural translation draft was produced without the intended audience immediately present at the time of production. The absence of an immediate audience simulated the context of radio recordings, which are often recorded in isolated studios without an immediate audience. Thus the aural version represents a form of mass media, intended for distribution through radio broadcast and other audio media such as streaming audio on the Internet, podcast, and mp3.

The foundation for this form of audio/visual oral drafting has its roots in Martin Culy's Top-Down Method of Translation (1995). However, in contrast to Culy's method, which makes use of written inputs, VAD utilizes a facilitator, as a bridge between the literate and oral, and gives the translator/crafter only audio and visual (non-literate) input, such as video, storyboard, props, self-drawn pictures, and other visual cues. The facilitator for the aural drafting was the current researcher Joshua Drake, age 27, college educated, native English speaker, with working proficiency in Mandarin Chinese, Koine Greek, Biblical Hebrew, and conversational Thai.

The procedure of the Visual-Audio Drafting (VAD) for the Aural Translation employed for this study described in the next sections.

3.2.2.1 Facilitator's preparation

The facilitator studied the texts in the original language. During the study of the source texts the facilitator strove to identify any relevant or possible confusion which might occur in the translation process. These areas of possible confusion were both in the understanding of the text from an interpretational standpoint, but also linguistic issues which may arise, such as contextual mismatch, unknown concepts, and key terms.

After this time in preparing the text, the facilitator met with the crafter. In this process the translator is referred to as a 'crafter' because she is not translating from one source language into a completely different target language. Instead she is taking a story from one medium and transferring it to another medium.

The facilitator gave the crafter an orientation and background to the passage that was to be crafted. Then the crafter listened to the passage from pre-recorded recorded sources. These pre-recorded Chinese sources were: Chinese Union Bible (1918) download from the internet and a self recorded version of the New Chinese Translation (2001), made by the crafter herself weeks prior to the crafting session. The pre-recorded English versions were the audio New Living Translation (1996) and the Message Bible (2002).

They were all equally used in each of the four crafting sessions, and they were always presented in the same order: Union Translation, New Chinese Translation, New Living Translation, and The Message. Once the crafter had listened to the entire initial translation, additional audio translation sources were added. English was used as a secondary language input, not only because the crafter and facilitator were fluent in English, and could use them, but also because these two English translations represent more meaning-base (NLT) and paraphrased (The Message) translations. These meaning-based and paraphrased translations allowed the meaning of the story and macro-features to be represented in a different way to the crafter. These alternative inputs were important as they allowed the crafter to have wider exposure to the semantic and notional structure of the story.

While listening to the audio source, a visual (but not literate/written) source was presented to the crafter. In this study the visual representations used were cut out copies of pictures from a picture Bible and a self-drawn storyboard created by the crafter. The picture Bible's images were used first and introduced alongside the second audio source (New Chinese Version). Then during exposure to the third and fourth audio sources, the crafter produced her own hand drawn, purely visual, and

non-literate storyboard sketch to help give her the flow of the story in the form of pictures without using words nor any form of literate cues.

The visual sources and representations utilized during the crafting process were used to help free the story from being merely a literal translation from the source text. Also, the multiple visual sources help safeguard against word-for-word audio translation/crafting. This procedure built upon and utilized the principles of BICS and CALP (Defined and discussed in section 2.2.4.1). Thus, the sources in this process, even though they are in one medium or language, were internalized with the help of the visual representations and re-expressed in a different language and medium.

During the process, the facilitator and the crafter discussed key terms and dealt with unknown concepts. In addition, areas of cultural significance were discussed, both for the original audience and the future audience who would receive the crafted version. Also, areas of clarity and possible ambiguity were discussed, taking into consideration the audience for which the translation is being produced. This discussion was done primarily in Mandarin Chinese, with English used only as needed. The audience of the aural translation was visualized as anyone who may come across a Christian radio station, website, or podcast, or be given an mp3 disk with the stories on them. Thus, any member of the audience may not be Christian, and may have little or no Biblical background.

3.2.2.2 Aural text drafted

Once the crafter had successfully internalized the story and no longer needed to use the audio and visual cues, the crafter then told the passage from memory in Mandarin Chinese to a microphone facing a wall (not facing the facilitator), without an audience present, for the sake of producing a recorded radio-style audio version. The only person present during the recording was the facilitator, but the translator was discouraged from interacting with the facilitator while telling the story. The crafter repeated this recording step as many times as she felt was needed to produce a suitable version. After each recording, the crafter would listen to what she had recorded before recording the next. After several recordings the crafter selected the version that she felt was the best aural version. In this study, the crafter told each story at least five times, to create an orally/aurally composed, refined, self-edited, crafted version of a story through the oral/aural medium without making use of written edits. This process of aural/oral composition through repetition of telling

and retelling was proposed by Green (2007:48), where she found that aural drafts start to settle in after being told about five times. The best telling, usually the fifth or sixth telling (but not earlier), was selected by Mrs. Wu and from then on considered the draft aural version of the story.

3.2.3 Oral-performance of the aural version

Mrs. Wu listened to the aural version of each story that had been selected. She was encouraged to internalize the story, but not just memorize it by rote.¹⁸ Once Mrs. Wu considered herself ready, each of the four stories were orally-performed by Mrs. Wu in front of the same small group of eight native Mandarin speakers on four separate occasions over a course of four days, in Chiang Mai, Thailand. Each story was told in front of the audience in the way which Mrs. Wu felt was the clearest, most accurate and intelligible way to communicate. As she told the story she was encouraged to stay faithful to the original by not adding any new information to the story or changing the content of the story in any way.

The audience was made up of six females and two males, all of whom were between the ages of 18-30. They were all Chinese Christians and had mixed educational backgrounds. They were in Thailand as part of a language and culture education program. They all had expressed interest in hearing Mrs. Wu tell them Bible Stories in an oral Chinese form.

3.2.4 Transcription of the oral-performance and aural versions

The oral-performances of each of the four stories were recorded on an audio mp3 recorder as well as a video recorder. The oral-performances were then transcribed from the audio/visual recording by the facilitator and Mrs. Wu. The aural versions were also transcribed at this time, after the oral-performance, so as not to influence the oral-performance by introducing a written form of the aural version. The oral-performance and aural version were transcribed and checked by the facilitator and Mrs. Wu. It was important that Mrs. Wu was involved in the transcription process, as there were several features of the aural and oral-performance which were open to interpretation when it came to transcription. An example of an area where interpretation was involved was how to represent particles, which are not usually used in written form. Thus Mrs. Wu was the final authority on the representation of

¹⁸ This process is sometimes referred to as 'learning' an oral story, as opposed to 'memorizing' it.

ambiguous areas in the transcription process. She also checked the aural and oral-performance transcription for accuracy. These transcriptions became a textual representation of the aural translation and Oral-Performance, and the basis of this study's analysis.

3.3 Display, annotation, and analysis of the three versions

After the production and transcription of the text corpus (written, aural, and oral-performance), it was then necessary to display the texts in such a way that they could be analyzed to isolate and highlight contrastive features among the three media.

The procedure for the preparing the corpus for three-way contrastive analysis is described in following sections: Version comparison, Word and clause boundary, Three fold three-layer contrastive text walk through; Word level analysis, Clause level analysis, and Story level analysis.

3.3.1 Version comparison

After the corpus was produced and collected, the stories in each medium were compared against each other. This was begun by assigning a prime color code to each base medium: written = red, blue = aural, and yellow = oral-performance. The method of assigning a color code in the comparison of three texts is adapted from redaction criticism.¹⁹ This color coding was utilized as a preliminary form of analysis to identify whether or not there was a statistical basis for contrast between the texts three media. Each story was divided up by the corresponding verse breaks in the written version as a starting point to provide a uniform numbered reference system. Syllables were the base unit of contrast, as they represented the smallest meaning component in the Chinese language, which is monosyllables and their corresponding individual character representation.

¹⁹ For an overview of Redaction Criticism see Perrin, Norman. *What is Redaction Criticism?* Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1969. This method for isolating overlap and contrast among different mediums, was adapted from the method of analyzing the synoptic gospels in *Biblical Studies Redaction Criticisms*, which originated in the 18th century in the work of Jean Astruc. In redaction criticism the three synoptic gospels (Matthew, Mark and Luke) are often color-coded showing where they contain may have shared the same source due to identical or similar wording and phrasing. This is done to discover the possible literary sources or oral traditions behind the composition of the Gospels. This method of identifying overlapping and contrasting words and phrases has been adapted in this study to allow identification of both preservation of the wording as it is transferred through the three mediums, and also areas of unique articulation.

After each discrete unit of phonetic data represented by each monosyllabic character in the written transcripts was color coded, an interlinear edition was produced in which each medium was displayed next to one another. Syllables were given a color-coding based on the type of overlap they represented. The color-coding display allowed base colors of each medium to overlap with the other media to produce new colors. For example the aural medium's base prime color was blue, while the base prime color of the oral-performance was yellow. Thus any phonetic unit that was shared by both the aural (+ aural) and oral-performance (+ oral-performance), but not by the written version (-written), is then represented by the color green (aural/blue + oral-performance/yellow = green) in the charts. Any phonetic unit shared by all three media is represented by grey. Thus each text was color coded based on the following coding:

- | | | | |
|-----------|----------|-------------------|-------------------|
| • Grey: | +written | +aural | +oral-performance |
| • Red: | +written | -aural | -oral-performance |
| • Blue: | -written | +aural | -oral-performance |
| • Yellow: | -written | -aural | +oral-performance |
| • Green: | +aural | +oral-performance | -written |
| • Purple: | +written | +aural | -oral-performance |
| • Orange: | +written | +oral-performance | -aural |

Once the corpus was color-coded in this way, then overlap and contrasting data that occurred throughout the entire corpus was displayed clearly. This allowed for contrastive material to be identified during initial analysis. This initial analysis led to the three layered contrastive walk through of the data presented in section 3.3.3, which ultimately led to the categories of contrast this study then focused on. Once these areas of contrast were isolated and identified, this then allowed for the application of different methods of discourse analysis to be applied so that specific contrastive features could be isolated and analyzed.

3.3.2 Word and clause boundaries

Next, Mrs. Wu went through each of the texts and marked what she considered to be word boundaries, so that the data would reflect emic word boundaries. This was done because, as David Crystal states, a 'word' is "A unit of expression which has universal intuitive recognition by native speakers" (Crystal 2008:500). Allowing Mrs. Wu to break up the text gave a consistency of analysis to this study and reflects her emic interpretations.

Next, each text was further divided into clauses, while still preserving the corresponding verse number of the written version for the sake of uniformity in

reference. The process of defining clause boundaries involved collaboration between the facilitator and Mrs. Wu. A clause was defined following Kroeger, "Clause: a simple sentence; the smallest grammatical unit which expresses a complete proposition (Kroeger 2005:342). The process involved Mrs. Wu setting clause boundaries. But when she was faced with an area of complication, the facilitator would explain the possible interpretations and allow Mrs. Wu to decide. Once a decision was made about an interpretation of a clause, this interpretation would be used throughout the corpus for similar issues. This clause division was done for the sake of expressing emic clause boundaries, and for the sake of uniformity and consistency throughout the corpus. These emic clause boundaries serve an important function in how the salience scheme and participant reference analysis was conducted and interpreted. It also allowed areas of contrast to be presented in manageable chunks which could be charted according to corresponding and non-corresponding sections.

3.3.3 Three fold three-layer contrastive text walk through

After the word and clause boundaries were prepared through the entire corpus, the facilitator went through a 'Three Fold Three-layer Contrastive Text Walk Through'²⁰ (3TWT) as the first step in analysis. The 3TWT analysis was done at word level, clause level, and story level. Under each of these levels, areas of interest and subcategories were investigated, as shown in the outline below. It is not claimed that this approach represents an exhaustive analysis.

WORD LEVEL:

Lexical,
Participant Reference, and
Particle.

CLAUSE LEVEL:

Time Phrases, and
Conjunctive phrases.

STORY LEVEL:

Storyline/Salience Scheme.

3.3.3.1 Word level analysis

The first step in 3TWT was to investigate the text on a word level. In the word level analysis, because of the findings of the initial contrastive color coding of the data,

²⁰ This term was coined by the present researcher to help describe the type of analysis which examines three texts side by side and isolates areas of contrast.

three areas of analysis are in focus: lexical, participant reference, and particles. First verbs and nouns were circled and counted for each version. Then explicit participant references were circled and counted for each version. Lastly, particles were circled and counted for each version.

After each of the word level categories was identified, it was decided whether there was enough preliminary patterned contrast shown in the data to warrant further investigation. During this investigation, the word level items of lexical, participant reference, and particles showed enough contrast to lead the researcher to further analysis. In the course of the study, there were several lexical issues such as lexical shift and change which were discovered. However, the examples of lexical shift and change were not sufficient enough to allow for further study at this time.

Participant reference was then examined in more detail to explore the areas of contrastive reference across the three media. In this detailed analysis special attention was given to implicit (zero anaphora) and explicit (pronoun and noun phrase) methods of reference. This participant reference charting was done utilizing a modified Dooley & Levisohn analysis (as mentioned in section 2.4.2.1 of the Literature Review).

Participant reference was analyzed using a subset of Givón's iconicity scale, which looked at explicit versus implicit methods of reference. Givón's iconicity principle states "The more disruptive, surprising, discontinuous or hard to process a topic is, the more coding material must be assigned to it" (Givón 1983:18). The scale of encoding from most to least in Mandarin Chinese is: 1) Noun phrase, 2) pronoun, and 3) zero anaphora. As in hypothesis 2 in section 1.5.2, it is proposed that the iconicity scale and principle can also be used to understand contrastive participant reference patterns between media. It is proposed that the different inherent characteristics between written and audio content will affect how participants are referenced: A possible reason for contrast in reference between media could be that audio content could be inherently harder to process in that it is streaming audio content received by the ears instead of a static text which allows for visual back-referencing of participants and re-reading sections of ambiguity. Thus, if the crafter considers these issues, consciously or subconsciously, Mandarin Chinese in the audio media should contain more coding of participants through noun phrases and pronouns. The written version on the other hand, may have more zero anaphora as participants may require less encoded tracking when tracked along a text with the eyes.

In this analysis, an inventory of all the ways in which participants were referenced in each of the stories was charted. Next, the results were analyzed in an attempt to discover discernible patterns which could be checked across the other three stories. Each story's inventory of participant reference were charted in text-sequential order. Next each of the corresponding sections' context (S1 = the subject is the same as the previous clause or sentence, S2 = the subject was the addressee of a speech resorted in a previous sentence. S3 = the subject was involved in the previous sentence in a non-subject role other than in a closed conversation. S4 = other changes of subject than those covered by S2 and S3.) and method of participant reference (zero anaphora, pro-form, noun-phrase) were highlighted and charted. The clauses with corresponding participant references in relation to S1-S4 environments provided the basis for the analysis. These sections allowed for a clear analysis of how each version/medium encoded participants explicitly or implicitly. It allowed for the areas of contrastive reference to be isolated. After this was done, then all of the referential sections of each story were analyzed.

Both the corresponding and non-corresponding reference occurrences were charted in relation to their introduction and S1-S4 distribution and their reference method across the three versions. They were then analyzed in relation to the percentage distribution in each category and method of reference, both in corresponding and non-corresponding tables.

Once the context and method of reference were identified, they were represented in a chart according to their number and relative percentages. Then a subset of Givón's iconicity scale was applied to the data in relation to explicit references versus implicit reference (zero anaphora). The tables were then re-charted leaving out of the analysis the zero anaphora references (implicit reference). Then areas of contrast were highlighted in order to isolate ways in which the three versions were differed in how they referred to and tracked participants through each version. Special attention was given to aspects of explicit reference contrasted against non-explicit reference, i.e. zero anaphora. This procedure enabled the investigation of the second hypotheses of this study, which stated that the oral-performance would contain more explicit methods of reference than the written version (See section of 1.5.2 for statement of hypothesis). What remained were charts of how many explicit references were in each of the three versions, both in corresponding sections and all sections (including non-corresponding sections). This allowed for a clear picture of which version/medium had the most explicit participant reference.

Particles were isolated and marked during the text walk through. Once they were marked they were then put into an inventory chart, representing the particle usage in each of the three versions. Once this chart was compiled, each of the particles was analyzed in relation to its use and distribution in the texts. During this analysis special attention was given to the environment in which the particle occurred, such as clause initial versus clause final and within direct quotations or outside quotations. Also, attention was given to particles which were unique to the oral-performance version. The particles which were unique to the oral-performance were then analyzed further to see if they represented any possible oral discourse markers.

3.3.3.2 Clause level analysis

The second step in the analysis process was to go through the text on a clause level, considering primarily areas of contrast discovered during the initial contrastive color-coding. These areas of contrast were the usage of temporal words and phrases, areas of conjunction and other areas of cohesion. As in the word level analysis, in each text temporal phrases and clause linkages were circled and counted throughout the text.

3.3.3.3 Story level analysis

Lastly, some story level features were analyzed. At this level, all the clauses of each story were charted side by side corresponding clauses between the three versions shared a line, while unique clauses had their own line. This allowed for contrast on a clausal level to be identified, especially areas where reordering and omission and addition of content between the versions occurred. Then each clause was identified in relation to this study's working salience scheme. After this, each of the Bands were counted and charted for each version. Contrast in the salience scheme can represent ways in which the interaction of medium and message may lead to certain bands being represented in different ways across the medium, as well as showing certain bands which may be isolated to only one of the media. This in essence can show how each medium embodies larger sections of each text, highlighting higher levels of contrast in how each of the stories are articulated as a whole between the three media in this study.

After this analysis walk-through was accomplished, the contrastive data from each level of analysis was synthesized and charted to provide a picture of the overall layout and nature of these contrastive areas.

3.4 Categorization and summary of findings.

This procedure was applied to the first sample text of Mark 2:1-12, and the patterns that arose in the analysis were used as the basis for further analysis of the other three texts. In this study, not every pattern was evaluated, but certain ones were selected for the sake of isolating and analyzing specific areas of contrast which were most salient across the three other stories and supported the hypothesis of this thesis. In addition, outstanding, and/or counter-pattern features are also mentioned as they arose through the analysis.

3.5 Conclusion

This chapter has laid out the working method for the production of the corpus used in this study. In addition, it presented the method used for displaying and analyzing the text corpus of this study. It showed how the areas of participant reference, particle distribution and usage, time reference, conjunctions, and salience scheme, are analyzed in the following chapter.

It also proposed the use of a subset of Givón's iconicity scale and applied it to Dooley and Levinsohn's method of participant reference in order to isolate contrast in relation to explicit reference across three media. It also adapted and applied Longacre's (1996) Etic Narrative Salience Scheme to include three-parallel texts.

In the following chapter, the procedure in this chapter is applied to the text of Mark 2:1-12 as an illustration and starting point of analysis. In this section, the Mark 2:1-12 text will be used as the starting point to discover possible patterns and trends in the data which will then be tested throughout the rest of the corpus.