

ASSESSING THE IMPACT OF USING THE NATIONAL LANGUAGE INSTEAD OF THE LEARNERS' MOTHER TONGUE IN PRIMARY EDUCATION IN MYANMAR

NAW KHU SHEE



Presented in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

MASTER OF ARTS
IN
LINGUISTICS

Payap University
April 2012



Title:

Assessing the Impact of Using the National Language Instead of the

Learners' Mother Tongue in Primary Education in Myanmar

Researcher:

Naw Khu Shee

Degree:

Master of Arts in Linguistics

Advisor:

Kimmo Kosonen, Ph.D.

Approval Date: 4 April 2012

Institution:

Payap University, Chiang Mai, Thailand

The members of the thesis examination committee:

Committee Chair (Isara Choosri, Ph.D.)

Committee Member (Kimmo Kosonen, Ph.D.)

Committee Member (Elissa Ikeda, Ph.D.)

Copyright © Naw Khu Shee Payap University 2012

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First, I thank God for giving me the opportunity to see Him at work throughout my study.

I would like to express my deep appreciation for the courteous and generous assistance of the many people who assisted me during the course of this study. In particularly, I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. Kimmo Kosonen, for his direction, assistance, and guidance. I would also like to thank Dr. Elissa Ikeda who gave me valuable suggestions about ethnographic research. I am deeply thankful to Dr. Robert Wyn Owen who assisted me in statistical analysis. I am also grateful to Oliver James who proof-read my writing. I also wish to express my gratitude and thanks to my teacher Sunny Hong for teaching me guidelines in doing qualitative analysis. Lastly, I offer my regards and blessings to all those who supported me in any respect during the completion of the thesis.

Naw Khu Shee April 2012 Title: Assessing the Impact of Using the National Language Instead

of the Learners' Mother Tongue in Primary Education in

Myanmar

Researcher:

Naw Khu Shee

Degree:

Master of Arts in Linguistics

Advisor:

Kimmo Kosonen, Ph.D.

Approval Date:

4 April 2012

Institution:

Payap University, Chiang Mai, Thailand

Number of Pages:

91

Keywords:

Primary education, Medium of instruction, Oral language of

instruction

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines whether learning through the mother tongue as an oral language of instruction may enhance academic achievement among the ethnic minority communities in Myanmar over learning solely through the national language. This study focuses on learners who are monolingual in Sgaw – one of the Karen language groups – and does not investigate multilingual/multicultural student populations. Furthermore, it investigates only the effects of oral instruction in the mother tongue; it does not consider the effects of using curriculum and material in the mother tongue or teaching literacy in the mother tongue.

There are two types of Grade 3 classes involved in the study. In one type of class, the teacher is bilingual in Burmese and Sgaw and uses Sgaw as an informal oral language of instruction as well as Burmese, since Burmese is the only official language of instruction. In the other type of class, the teacher uses Burmese only. This study attempts to find the answers to the questions: (1) How do test scores reflect the effect of the language of instruction on children's learning achievement in school? (2) How does classroom interaction demonstrate the effect of the language of instruction on children's experience of learning in school?

evaluate the Grade 3 test scores from 7 classes with a Burmese-speaking teacher and 12 classes with a Sgaw-speaking teacher. Qualitative analysis was carried out using the data from interviews and classroom observations. The study reveals that using only the national language in the early years in a school in a minority community impedes comprehension. On the other hand, use of the mother tongue appears to promote the development of cognitive skills as well as facilitate both the use of good teaching and learning strategies. The thesis concludes with recommendations and suggestions for further research based on the study's findings.

ชื่อเรื่อง: การประเมินผลกระทบของการใช้ภาษาประจำชาติแทน

การใช้ภาษาแม่ในระดับประถมศึกษาในประเทศพม่า

ผู้วิจัย: นอว์ คู ชี

ปริญญา: ศิลปศาสตรมหาบัณฑิต สาขาวิชาภาษาศาสตร์

อาจารย์ที่ปรึกษาวิทยานิพนธ์หลัก: ดร.คิมโม โคโซเน็น

วันที่อนุมัติผลงาน: 4 เมษายน 2555

สถาบันการศึกษา: มหาวิทยาลัยพายัพ จังหวัดเชียงใหม่ ประเทศไทย

จำนวนหน้า: 9

คำสำคัญ: ประถมศึกษา, สื่อการเรียนการสอน, การใช้ภาษาพูดใน

การเรียนการสอน, ภาษาแม่, ภาษาประจำชาติ

บทคัดย่อ

วิทยานิพนธ์ฉบับนี้มีวัตถุประสงค์เพื่อศึกษาการเรียนรู้โดยใช้ภาษาพูดที่เป็นภาษาแม่เป็นสื่อในการ เรียนการสอนจะเพิ่มผลสัมฤทธิ์ทางการเรียนของชนกลุ่มน้อยในประเทศพม่าได้มากกว่าการเรียนรู้ โดยใช้ภาษาประจำชาติเพียงอย่างเดียวหรือไม่ งานวิจัยนี้ศึกษาเฉพาะกลุ่มนักเรียนที่พูดภาษา สะกอได้เพียงภาษาเดียว ซึ่งภาษาสะกอเป็นภาษาหนึ่งในกลุ่มภาษากะเหรี่ยง มิได้ศึกษากลุ่ม นักเรียนที่พูดได้หลายภาษาหรือที่มาจากชุมชนพหุ วัฒนธรรม และมุ่งศึกษาเฉพาะผลของการใช้ ภาษาพูดที่เป็นภาษาแม่ในการเรียนการสอน โดยมิได้พิจารณาผลของการใช้หลักสูตรและสื่อการ สอนในภาษาแม่หรือความสามารถในการสอนโดยใช้ภาษาแม่

กลุ่มตัวอย่างในงานวิจัยนี้เป็นนักเรียนชั้นประถมศึกษาปีที่ 3 จำนวน 2 กลุ่ม กลุ่มที่ 1 ผู้สอนพูดได้ 2 ภาษา คือ ภาษาพม่าและภาษาสะกอ ผู้สอนใช้ภาษาสะกอเป็นภาษาพูดแบบไม่เป็นทางการใน การเรียนการสอน และใช้ภาษาพม่าด้วย เนื่องจากเป็นภาษาราชการที่ใช้ในโรงเรียน กลุ่มที่ 2 ผู้สอนใช้ภาษาพม่าเท่านั้น งานวิจัยนี้ต้องการตอบคำถามต่อไปนี้ (1) ผลคะแนนการทดสอบจะ สะท้อนให้เห็นผลของการใช้ภาษาในการเรียนการสอนต่อผลสัมฤทธิ์ทางการเรียนของนักเรียนใน โรงเรียนอย่างไร? (2) การมีปฏิสัมพันธ์ในห้องเรียนแสดงให้เห็นผลของภาษาที่ใช้ในการเรียนการ สอนต่อประสบการณ์การเรียนรู้ของนักเรียนในโรงเรียนอย่างไร?

การเก็บข้อมูลใช้การวิจัยเชิงชาติพันธุ์วรรณนา โดยเก็บข้อมูลจากหมู่บ้านที่มีประชากรเกือบ ทั้งหมดเป็นกลุ่มชาติพันธุ์สะกอ และใช้การวิเคราะห์เชิงปริมาณในการประเมินผลคะแนนการ ห้อง และห้องเรียนที่ผู้สอนพูดภาษาสะกอเป็นภาษาแม่ 12 ห้อง ส่วนการวิเคราะห์เชิงคุณภาพใช้ ข้อมูลจากการสัมภาษณ์และการสังเกตชั้นเรียน ผลการวิจัยพบว่า การใช้ภาษาประจำชาติเพียง ภาษาเดียวในช่วงชั้นต้นของการศึกษา เป็นอุปสรรคต่อการทำความเข้าใจของนักเรียนในโรงเรียน ที่อยู่ในชุมชนกลุ่มชาติพันธุ์ชนกลุ่มน้อย ในทางตรงข้าม การใช้ภาษาแม่ดูเหมือนจะช่วยส่งเสริม การพัฒนาทักษะทางปัญญาของนักเรียน และส่งเสริมการใช้กลยุทธ์ที่ดีในการเรียนการสอนด้วย วิทยานิพนธ์ฉบับนี้ได้ให้คำแนะนำและข้อเสนอแนะจากข้อค้นพบดังกล่าวสำหรับงานวิจัยใน อนาคตด้วย

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ii
Abstract	iii
บทคัดย่อ	
List of Tables	x
List of Figures	xi
List of Abbreviations and Symbols	xii
Glossary	xiii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.1.1 People and language	3
1.1.2 National education system	3
1.2 Scope and Focus of the Study	4
1.2.1 Focus language group	4
1.2.2 Background problem this study seeks to address	
1.2.3 Research questions and hypotheses	7
1.3 Benefits of the Study	7
1.4 Scope and Limitations of the Study,	8
1.5 Outline of the Study	8
Chapter 2 Theoretical Overview	. 10
2.1 Terms and Concepts Related to the Study	. 10
2.1.1 Mother tongue (MT) or first language (L1)	. 10
2.1.2 National language (NL) or second language (L2)	
2.1.3 Language of instruction (LOI)	. 11
2.1.4 Bilingualism or multilingualism	. 11
2.2 Language in Minority Children's Education	. 12
2.3 Mother Tongue-based Education	. 14
2.3.1 Primary education through the mother tongue	. 14
2.3.2 Learning in L1 vs. learning in L2	. 16
2.4 Summary	. 18
Chapter 3 Research Methodology	. 19
3.1 Preliminary Research	19

3.1.1 Library research and internet research	19
3.1.2 Preparation for data collection	20
3.1.3 Choice of research sites	20
3.2 Field Work	22
3.3 Data Collection Techniques	23
3.3.1 Interviews	23
3.3.2 Test scores	
3.3.3 Classroom observations	25
3.4 Data Analysis	26
3.5.1 imitations	2.7
Chapter 4 The Context of the Study	28
4.1 Overview of Research Sites	28
4.1.1 General background information of the villages	28
4.1.2 Organizations	29
4.2 Description of Each Village	31
4.3 Case Study Classes	37
4.3.1 Schools	37
4.3.2 Classrooms	
4.3.3 Grade 3 learners	38
4.3.4 Class teachers	39
4.3.5 Subjects	39
4.3.6 Language use in the observed classes	39
Chapter 5 The Analysis of the Learners' Test Results	41
5.1 Overview of the data	
5.2 Test System	43
5.2.1 Test procedure	43
5.2.2 Test papers	43
5.2.3 Test scores	48
5.3 Description of Factors	
5.3.1 Unmeasured factors	50
5.3.2 Measured factors	51
5.3.3 Summary of factors	
5.4 Analysis of Test Scores	
5.4.1 Analysis of Burmese test scores	57
5.4.2 Analysis of Science test scores	60
5.4.3 Analysis of Mathematics test scores	62

5.4.4 Analysis of English test scores
5.5 Summary of Findings65
5.6 Discussion of Results
Chapter 6 Analysis of the Interviews and the Classroom Observations
6.1 Overview of the Data68
6.2 Analysis Procedure
6.3 Evidence of the Impact of Language Choices
6.3.1 Effects of teaching in the national language
6.3.2 Effects of teaching in the mother tongue
6.3.3 Reasons why mother tongue-based education is needed
6.4 Summary of Findings
6.5 Discussion of Analysis
Chapter 7 Conclusion and Discussions
7.1 Overview of the Study
7.1 Overview of the Study
7.2.1 Conclusions based on quantitative analysis
7.2.2 Conclusions based on qualitative analysis
7.3 Implications of Research Findings
7.3.1 Implications for primary education in the learners' mother tongue 88
7.3.2 Implications for planning education with smooth L1-L2 transition 89
7.3.3 Implications for promoting mother tongue-based education
7.4 Suggestions for Further Research
7.4.1 Further investigation of the present study
7.4.2 New topics arising from the present study
Bibliography
Appendix A Classroom Observation Notes
Resume104

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Schools and other education programs in the villages	31
Table 2 Summary of the data	
Table 3 Teacher language median results for the class data in Table 2	
Table 4 Summary of classroom process	
Table 5 Checklist for the student learning (Save the Children 2009: 2)	83

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 Map of Union of Myanmar and Neighboring Countries (Source: United Nations 2008)	2
Figure 2 Myanmar Map showing internal administrative boundaries (Source:	
Myanmar's Net)	5
Figure 3 Comparison of learners learning through their first language and an	
unfamiliar language (UNESCO 2007: 7)	17
Figure 4 Map of Pathein (source: Wikipedia)	32
Figure 5 Dotplot for all male scores in Burmese	49
Figure 6 Boxplots of scores in classes	52
Figure 7 Dotplot for Burmese median (by teacher language in Grades 1 and 2)	
Figure 8 Burmese median scores (by class size)	
Figure 9 Difference in median Burmese test scores (Female minus Male)	
Figure 10 Cumulative percentage plot for Burmese (by teacher language in Grad	e 3)
	56
Figure 11 Output from R computer package for mean rank on Burmese test	57
Figure 12 Mean rank on Burmese test	58
Figure 13 Output from R computer package for mean score on Burmese test	59
Figure 14 Mean score on Burmese test	59
Figure 15 Output from R computer package for mean rank on Science test	60
Figure 16 Mean rank on Science test	61
Figure 17 Output from R computer package for mean rank on Mathematics test	
Figure 18 Mean rank on Mathematics test	63
Figure 19 Output from R computer package for mean rank on English test	
Figure 20 Mean rank on English test	64

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND SYMBOLS

BICS = Basic Interpersonal Communicative Skills

CE = Christian Education

CALP = Cognitive Academic Language Proficiency

ECCD = Early Childhood Care and Development

KBC = Karen Baptist Convention

L1 = First language

L2 = Second language

L3 = Third language

LOI = Language of instruction

LWC = Language of wider communication

MT = Mother tongue

MTBMLE = Mother tongue-based multilingual education

NGO = Non-governmental organization

NL = National language

PCF = Pestalozzi Children Foundation

PMA = Pathein-Myaungmya Association

UNICEF = United Nations Children's Fund

VCT = Village Community Teacher

GLOSSARY

Average – There are three main ways of determining a 'typical' or 'average' value from a set of numbers, the mean, median, and mode. These will be illustrated with the following example data set comprising 7 numbers {1, 5, 4, 9, 13, 1, 2} The mode is the value which occurs most often – in this case the number 1 occurs twice so the mode or modal value is 1. The mean value is calculated by adding together all the values and dividing by the number of values – here (1+5+4+9+13+1+2)/7=35/7=5. The median is the number that separates the largest 50% of the data values from the smallest 50%. To find the median, first arrange the values in order of increasing size, i.e., 1, 1, 2, 4, 5, 9, 13. In this case where there are an odd number of data values, the median is the middle number, i.e., 4. (In cases where there are even numbers of data values, the median is calculated by finding the mean of the two middle numbers.)

Normal Distribution – The normal distribution is a statistical distribution whose possible values form a bell-shaped curve around the average value. For this distribution all three measures of average (mean, median and mode) value are exactly the same.

Significant result – A result is said to be significant if the associated P-value is sufficiently small – typically defined to be less than 0.05. Essentially if a result is significant at the 5% level, there is less than a 5% chance that the extreme result was obtained by chance.

P-value – This is the probability of achieving the observed result or a more extreme result if the hypothesis being tested holds true. If the P-value is 'small' – typically defined as being less than 0.05 – then the result is said to be significant.

Result of practical importance – Appropriate statistical techniques can determine whether or not a result is significant, but a value judgement must also be made by

someone knowledgeable in the area of the investigation about whether the result is of any practical importance. For example, a study might show that in a particular sample boys' scores were on average 0.2% higher than girls' scores. Furthermore, the result may be statistically significant. However, to decide whether this result is of practical importance, requires knowledge of the particular test on which the test scores were obtained as well as more general knowledge about educational testing.

Rank – The data are arranged in order of increasing size. The smallest value has rank 1, the second smallest rank 2 etc. Replacing the actual data values by their ranks is a technique used in Statistics to overcome problems (such as lack of normality) with the distribution of the observed data.

Linear Regression – Linear regression is a statistical modelling technique that relates observed values of some response variable (such as student test scores in Mathematics) to a linear combination of predictor variables (such as gender or teacher language). In its simplest form – known as 'simple linear regression – a straight line is fitted through the set of points obtained when plotting the response values versus the values of a single predictor variable.

Fixed Effects Model – In a fixed effects model for an experiment the predictor variables have a predetermined set of (fixed) values. Inferences can only be made for those values of the predictor variables used in the model. For example, suppose a model included a variable measuring social status and observations were for 'Working Class' and 'Middle Class'. Then no inferences could be made for anybody outside of these categories of social status.

Random Effects Model – In a random effects model for an experiment the values used for the predictor variables are randomly selected from a population of possible values for those variables. Because the levels are randomly selected, inferences can be made for all levels of the factors in the population, not just those included in the experiment. For example, if a sample of schools were randomly selected from a population of all such schools in a given region, the 'school effect' would be a random factor because

the schools were randomly selected. Inferences can be made for all schools in the population.

Mixed Effects Model – In a mixed model for an experiment, the levels of some of the factors used in the experiment are randomly selected from a population of possible levels, whereas the levels of the other factors in the experiment are predetermined. Inferences for the fixed effects are only possible for the levels of the factors used in the experiment. Inferences for the random effects are for the whole population of values from which the random effects were selected. Mixed effects models are particularly useful when repeated measurements are made on the same statistical units or when measurements are made on clusters of related statistical units.

Longitudinal Study – Longitudinal study is a research study that involves repeated observations of the same variables over long period of time.